DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 327 779 CG 023 083

TITLE Character Development in the 90s: A Reaffirmation of Values. Teaching Values in Arizona Schools. The Report of the Task Force on Values in Education for the State of Arizona.

INSTITUTION Arizona State Dept. of Education, Phoenix.

PUB DATE Jun 90

NOTE 42p.

PUB TYPE Reports - General (140)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.

DESCRIPTORS *Citizenship Education; Democratic Values; Educational Principles; Elementary Secondary Education; *Ethical Instruction; *Moral Values; Public Schools; *Social Values; State School District Relationship; *Statewide Planning; *Values Education

IDENTIFIERS *Arizona

ABSTRACT

Pursuant to a request from the Arizona State Board of Education, an interagency task force was formed in fall 1989 to examine the issue of values instruction in Arizona schools. This document begins with a summary of the resulting report, along with a list of suggested common core values, recommendations for development and implementation of a values instruction program, and an historical perspective on values instruction. Appended is the full text of the task force report, "Character Development in the 90s: A Reaffirmation of Values." This report states and develops 10 consensual premises underlying values instruction: (1) that values need to be taught; (2) that society supports an increased role for the public school in values instruction; (3) that values instruction needs to be defined; (4) that a common core of values exists within our society; (5) that values play a role in education and that teachers and administrators play a part in transmitting values; (6) that values are taught implicitly and explicitly throughout the curriculum, by instruction, practices, and personal example; (7) that educators should be aware of differing values and ethics of the community; (8) that knowledge from research in values education and child development should be considered in developing a program; (9) that goals of values instruction should be established in terms of student behavior and character development; and (10) that a recognized philosophy of values instruction and commitment to its implementation should be adopted and implemented. Also appended are state board members' comments on the values education report and a list of the values education task force members. A bibliography is included. (TE)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

CG

ED327779

CHARACTER DEVELOPMENT IN THE 90s: A REAFFIRMATION OF VALUES

Teaching Values In Arizona Schools

The Report of the Task Force on Values in Education for the State of Arizona

Arizona Department of Education
C. Diane Bishop, State Superintendent of Public Instruction

June 1990

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
Paul H. Koehler
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CG023083

ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

C. Diane Bishop, Superintendent

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

David Silva ..... President

Dr. Reginald E. Barr ..... Vice President

Honorable C. Diane Bishop ..... Executive Officer

Claudeen Bates Arthur ..... Member

S. R. Grande ..... Member

Jerry Johnson ..... Member

Dr. Henry Koffler ..... Member

Rita Nader ..... Member

Ada Thomas ..... Member

maa280.4

"A free society cannot survive unless
the values upon which it is
grounded are fully comprehended by
each succeeding generation."

The Task Force on Values Education and Ethical
Behavior of the Baltimore County Public Schools

CONTENTS

Section I.	Recommendation to the State Board of Education	1
	Introduction	2
Section II.	Summary of *Character Development in the 90s: A Reaffirmation of Values*	3
Section III.	Program Implementation Recommendations	6
Section IV.	A Historical Perspective	8
Appendix A	*Character Development in the 90s: A Reaffirmation of Values*	10
	Premises Underlying Values Instruction	11
	A Suggested Common Core of Values	21
Appendix B	State Board Members Comments on Values Education Report	28
Appendix C	Values Education Task Force Members	35
Bibliography		36

RECOMMENDATION TO STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Local school boards in Arizona should be encouraged to support the teaching and reinforcing of a common core of values in every grade level of every school.

A common core of universal, time-tested values based on the United States Constitution and the Declaration of Independence should be selected and recommended to the local school district governing boards by parents, community members and educators.

Values should be taught by all teachers and staff by example, by precept and by any other methods found to be effective and supported by the community.

Parents must be actively and continually involved in the teaching of values in the home and at school if the program is to be successful.

Success in developing values in students will be reflected in the attitudes and conduct of the students.

Each year the parents, community members and educators should review their previous recommendations and make recommendations for values to be emphasized during the next year.

NOTE: The report entitled *Character Development in the 90s: A Reaffirmation of Values* is attached as Appendix A. This material was carefully prepared by members of the State Board of Education Task Force on Values in Education for the State of Arizona. It is hoped that this material will be made available to those parents, community members and educators who are selecting the values to be taught. It is hoped that they will find it to be a useful resource.

INTRODUCTION

Societal concerns regarding such things as changing family structures, student discipline problems and substance abuse have led to a belief that schools ought to take an increased role in re-emphasizing values. The State Board of Education, as a response to these concerns, requested that a task force be formed to examine the issue of values instruction in the Arizona schools.

The Task Force was formed in the fall of 1989 with membership from a wide range of interests including the state Legislature, teachers, school administrators, school boards, State Board of Education, religious organizations, the medical and counseling professions and the Arizona Department of Education. This diverse membership provided a unique perspective on the issue of values instruction in the schools. The Task Force met at least monthly from 1989 to May 1990 to study the issues and make the recommendations contained in this report.

With our nation's history of freedom and cultural diversity, as well as constitutional separation of church and state, ***we are mindful of the fact that there is no way to supplant the home as a traditional source of moral education.*** We believe that schools have the responsibility of instructing our students in certain principles fundamental to the continuation of a free society, which cannot survive unless the values upon which it is grounded are fully comprehended and practiced by each succeeding generation. There was *no intent* on the part of the Task Force to encourage Arizona's schools to embrace the kind of values clarification attempted years ago which often resulted in confusion on the part of the students about the meaning of commonly held values.

The Task Force in its deliberations has sought to provide schools which choose to address values with a suggested method of approaching the subject (the premises upon which a program might be based) and a common core of values on which the teaching might be based. The values to be taught and how and when they are taught should be decided by each school district with significant interaction among parents, community members and educators. **Values selected for a program should be confined to that core of values which is common to virtually all, not just a simple majority. The purpose of this report is to provide a starting point for this process.**

The Task Force reiterates that the primary source of moral education is the home. The Task Force also recognizes that the values upon which a society is founded must be transmitted to each succeeding generation if that society is to endure. The schools should seek to reinforce the universal values that are already being taught in the homes. School programs should not be in conflict with these values.

SUMMARY OF *CHARACTER DEVELOPMENT IN THE 90s: A REAFFIRMATION OF VALUES*

Premises Underlying Values Instruction

After much deliberation, the Task Force arrived at 10 premises regarding values instruction and ethical behavior which provide a useful framework for organizing the values instruction program:

1. CHILDREN DO NOT AUTOMATICALLY HOLD VALUES—THEY LEARN THEM; THEREFORE, VALUES NEED TO BE TAUGHT.

   In order for a society to endure, certain sets of values must be taught which promote the well-being of the society and its individuals.

2. EDUCATORS MUST UNDERSTAND THAT SOCIETY SUPPORTS AN INCREASED ROLE FOR THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS IN VALUES INSTRUCTION.

   The annual Gallup Poll pertaining to educational perceptions asked: "Would you favor or oppose instruction in the schools that deals with morals and moral behavior?" The results support the original premise—79% of the respondents favored such instruction. Moreover, 85% of parents with children in public schools favored moral education.

3. VALUES INSTRUCTION NEEDS TO BE DEFINED.

   Values instruction may be defined as the teaching of essential principles or standards which guide behavior and are unifying to the members of a democratic community, a community which depends for its existence upon the informed consent of the governed.

4. THERE SHOULD BE RECOGNITION THAT A COMMON CORE OF VALUES EXISTS WITHIN OUR SOCIETY.

   A suggested common core of values may be defined as:

   Responsible citizenship
   Respect for others
   Respect for self
   Respect for natural environment
   Respect for knowledge

5. TEACHERS AND ADMINISTRATORS SHOULD HAVE A GREATER AWARENESS OF THE POTENTIAL ROLE OF VALUES IN EDUCATION AND OF THEIR PART IN TRANSMITTING VALUES.

   Values are an integral part of the school program since values are contained in school programs and materials and are communicated by example.

6. EDUCATORS SHOULD BE AWARE THAT VALUES ARE TAUGHT IMPLICITLY AND EXPLICITLY THROUGH THE CURRICULUM, BY INSTRUCTION, BY PRACTICES AND THROUGH PERSONAL EXAMPLE.

   Values permeate the entire school system. The content of the curriculum, the organization and administration of individual classrooms and the schools all play a vital role in values instruction.

7. EDUCATORS SHOULD BE AWARE OF THE DIFFERING VALUES AND ETHICS OF THE COMMUNITY.

   It is very important that the community be involved in formulating any values instruction program. The involvement of parents is vital.

8. KNOWLEDGE GAINED FROM RESEARCH IN THE FIELDS OF VALUES EDUCATION AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED IN DEVELOPING A PROGRAM.

   There are many valuable resources to assist in the development of programs and policies, including important, valid and generally recognized research and public commentary. These resources should be carefully considered when developing a program.

9. GOALS FOR THE OUTCOME OF VALUES INSTRUCTION IN TERMS OF STUDENT BEHAVIOR AND CHARACTER DEVELOPMENT SHOULD BE ESTABLISHED.

   Following exposure to values instruction, students should be better able and more willing to exhibit behaviors associated with the common core of values.

10. IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT A RECOGNIZED PHILOSOPHY OF VALUES INSTRUCTION AND COMMITMENT TO ITS IMPLEMENTATION BE ADOPTED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY RESOURCES, IMPLEMENTED BY THE SCHOOL SYSTEM AND COMMUNICATED TO ALL RELATED GROUPS.

    It is recommended through this document that the State Board of Education adopt a commitment to a values instruction program which promotes a higher degree of excellence for all human beings.

A Suggested Common Core of Values

A suggested common core of values based upon responsible citizenship, respect for the environment, respect for others, respect for self and respect for knowledge is outlined below.

Responsible Citizenship

- Respect for the United States and Arizona constitutions
- Acknowledgment of authority
- Awareness of international relationships
- Justice/Fairness
- Patriotism
- Property rights
- Due process of law
- Freedom of thought and action
- Reasoned argument
- Respect for the law

Respect for Others

- Compassion and service to others
- Courtesy and cooperativeness
- Honesty
- Loyalty
- Moderation
- Recognition and understanding of various ethnic traditions
- Human worth and dignity
- Tolerance
- Equality of opportunity under the law

Respect for Our Environment

- Care for and conservation of all living things
- Care for and conservation of land, air, water
- Conduct recognizing environmental interdependence

Respect for Self

- Accountability
- Courage
- Frugality/Thrift
- Self-esteem and pride
- Self-discipline
- Self-reliance
- Cleanliness
- Personal responsibility for one's actions

Respect for Knowledge

- Desire to learn
- Analytic, creative and evaluative thinking
- Application of knowledge
- Objectivity
- Order

PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS

The following are suggestions for implementation of a values instruction program:

1. The State Board of Education will send a *recommendation* for implementation to the school district boards.

2. The district board may choose to review the recommended program, pass it on to a study committee or pass it on to separate school-based committees.

3. Committees may be made up of school board members, administrators, teachers, parents, community leaders, business leaders, students. Every program to be developed in Arizona should have a component of home activity and parental involvement.

4. The district board has the legal authority to approve or disapprove proceeding with implementation. If the school board approves the premise, it must then set a time frame for development of the local plan (to be done by a parent/community group, school-based group or a combination as described in 3. above).

5. The development committee should be clearly open to the public, open to all individuals who want to be involved and should actively seek broad-based involvement from the local community.

6. Once a program is approved, a continual means of evaluation should be provided by the committee.

Program development suggestions:

1. The committee may choose to review the responsibilities of the committee; identify meeting location, time, time frame, deadline; and review synopses from other districts, along with the State Board's recommendations.

2. After the development committee is formed, it must first discuss what values will be taught locally. There are two possible methods of identification: approach the community regarding which values are to be taught or decide on values within the committee.

3. The committee may break down into subcommittees:
   a. Scope and Sequence Committee - to discuss what will be taught at which instructional levels.
   b. Community Outreach Committee - public relations, to go out to the parent-teacher groups, civic groups, church groups, and the community at large.
   c. Materials Committee - to review and suggest appropriate materials for use in the classrooms.
   d. Curriculum Committee - to establish how the values will be taught and how they will fit into the curriculum.

4. The committee will work toward integration of programs into the existing curriculum and/or develop additional programs.

5. The committee should stay active during and after implementation to provide evaluation and feedback on the success of the program.

Recommendations for implementation:

1. Provide for school-based values instruction programs by distributing to each school a blueprint for implementation. Each school, separately, would answer the following questions:

   a) Will you incorporate the program?
   b) How will you involve parents?
   c) Which values will you address?
   d) How do you plan to implement the program?
   e) How will you report to the school board on your plans?

2. It is recommended that each value be defined for common teaching and understanding.

3. It is recommended that there be recommendations of values from which the local community may choose those to be included in the values instruction program.

4. The values instruction program recommendation cannot, and may not, be in conflict with state law.

5. Parents of students participating in a values instruction program must be notified about which values are being taught and in which course(s).

A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE ON VALUES INSTRUCTION
Prepared by Dr. Phillip E. England, committee member

Increasing alarm about the morality of our young people is aggravated by a number of forces: fragmentation of the family; decline of trust in public institutions; increasing public concern about questionable practices in government, business and industry; the impact of the mass media; drug abuse and our gradually increasing affluence. All of these forces help foster a materialistic, "me-first" attitude.

These issues and others that have confounded moral education over the past century are greatly intensified today. How do we respond to the wide divergency of viewpoints concerning the proper methods of values education in our public schools in Arizona? How does the school balance common values with pluralistic beliefs? What should be the relationship between religion and values education in the public schools? Should values education emphasize indoctrination or reasoning? How does values education find a place in a curriculum already stretched to the limit? Should values education be taught as a separate subject or infused throughout the curriculum? And possibly the most important question, how can schools build support in the community for values education?

In earlier times, American schools did not find such questions troubling. The predecessors of today's public schools were founded under a Massachusetts law passed in 1647, 27 years after the first settlers landed in that colony. The law, Ye Old Deluder Satan Act, established the right of the state to require compulsory schooling for the young. The aim of the law was to establish schools that would deliberately foster morality.

Values education is certainly not a new idea that has been suddenly thrust upon us. It has been a part of public education since the earliest times in America.

Indeed then, what kind of human being do we want to emerge from our efforts at moral education? What are the characteristics of the morally mature person?

Moral maturity is not simple knowing what is right. Most people know what is right, but set aside these values when they find it expedient to do so.

To be moral means to *value* morality, to take one's moral obligations and beliefs seriously. It means we must practice what we preach. Not only must we judge what is right; but also, we must care deeply about doing what is right. Only then will moral judgment and feeling translate into effective moral action.

A moral individual will:
- care about the welfare of others
- respect human dignity
- seek peaceful resolution of conflicts
- think about the consequences of decisions
- seek social justice
- promote human equality
- refrain from prejudiced actions
- practice self-control, diligence, fairness, kindness, tolerance and honesty in everyday life

Religion is a major force in the lives of many Americans. For these individuals, the first and foremost moral guide is their own religion. While the theological doctrines of religions differ substantially, there is a great deal of overlap in moral theologies, particularly in their everyday application. However, broad areas of consensus exist regarding concern for our fellow human beings, honesty in our dealings with one another, respect for property and numerous other moral issues.

There are many Americans, however, in whose lives religion does not play a significant role. There are still others who, for a variety of reasons, are antagonistic to religion. For them, moral education based on religion and appeals to religious principles to solve moral issues are serious affronts. Some religious people are equally affronted by public schools teaching students to look outside their religious tradition for moral guidance.

Public schools, committed as they are to serving all Americans, must approach this question with understanding, sensitivity and willingness to compromise. Teachers should stress the democratic and intellectual bases for morality, while still allowing their students to bring all their intellectual, cultural and religious resources to bear on moral issues.

Appreciating the differences in our pluralistic society is fundamental to the success of our democracy. Our nation, and indeed our state, must help us find our common moral ground and help us learn to live together on it.

Values education is not only inevitable in our schools, it is essential. All societies have public systems to help develop moral principles in children. In Arizona, our schools are a central part of that system. Our schools cannot ignore values education, it is one of their most important responsibilities.

How then, can we go about implementing a values education program in our public schools?

There are several things we can do:

- Educators can form a partnership with parents; the mass media; the business community; the courts; and civic, racial, ethnic and religious groups to create a social and cultural context that supports the schools' efforts to develop a program of values education. This should be done on an individual district basis.

- Consensus must be reached on which specific values should be taught.

- Schools need to make sure values education goes beyond the cognitive domain to include the affective and behavioral as well. Students need not only to learn what is good; they also must prize what is good and do what is good.

- While deciding what values are taught should be a cooperative effort from the entire community, where the values are taught and how they are taught should be a ***responsibility of the schools.***

- Once a values education program is implemented, it should be continually evaluated. The results of these assessments should be communicated to the parents and community through notations about pupil conduct on report cards, notes of praise or criticism to parents and recognition for individuals or groups whose conduct is praiseworthy.

APPENDIX A

CHARACTER DEVELOPMENT IN THE 90s: A REAFFIRMATION OF VALUES

Premises Underlying Values Instruction

Premise 1

CHILDREN DO NOT AUTOMATICALLY HOLD VALUES—THEY LEARN THEM; THEREFORE, VALUES NEED TO BE TAUGHT.

In order for our society to endure, certain sets of values must be taught which promote the well-being of our society and its individuals. The child is exposed to values, both random and intentional, which may be destructive or beneficial to our democratic society. The child then either is taught correct values, is not taught any values or stumbles onto values haphazardly. However:

1. The various social and criminal problems in society would indicate that beneficial values are not being acquired.

2. There are more ambiguities in our societal values and more challenges to appropriate values than ever before in the history of our nation.

3. This is due, at least in part, to such things as the weakening of the family structure, the negative influence of the media, divorce and negative peer pressure.

Therefore, we as a society need to avail ourselves of every opportunity to influence the learning of our children to assure that a common core of values is being taught—particularly within the school setting.

Premise 2

EDUCATORS MUST UNDERSTAND THAT SOCIETY SUPPORTS AN INCREASED ROLE FOR THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS IN VALUES INSTRUCTION.

Social scientists turn to public opinion polls to discern public attitudes. For 14 years or more, Gallup has conducted such surveys relative to the public schools' roles and performances. Suzanne Burkholder, Kevin Ryan and Virgil Blanke in "Values, the Key to a Community" in *Phi Delta Kappan*, March 1981, observed:

> Many U.S. citizens today appear to believe that the public schools neither reflect nor support the values held by their clients. Nor do they see public schools exerting a sufficiently positive moral influence on young people.

The annual Gallup Poll of the public's attitudes toward the public schools asked: "What do you think are the biggest problems with which the public schools in this community must deal?" The results related to values education, specifically noting "the lack of discipline and the use of dope/drugs" among American students in general. These responses to a public opinion poll reflect a poor moral climate.

The annual Gallup Poll pertaining to educational perceptions also asked: "Would you favor or oppose instruction in the schools that deals with morals and moral behavior?" The results support the original premise--79% of the respondents favored such instruction. Moreover, 85% of parents with children in public schools favored moral education. Only 4% of the respondents having children in public schools opposed values education.

A later annual Gallup Poll on the same topic reported that 69% of the respondents did not have children presently in school; however, this sampled population still discerned the need for improvement and instruction in moral education. This conclusion is based upon the respondents' recognition of discipline as the number one problem of American education.

Professor Edward Wynne in "Rigorous Thinking About Character," *Phi Delta Kappan*, November 1982, echoes many of the polled respondents when he observed:

> If schools are to enhance the character of students, they must discourage the practice of those vices that are the obverse of these virtues: lying, vandalism, rudeness, selfishness, and lax attendance should be prohibited and punished. Conversely, students who conspicuously display virtue should be appropriately recognized and rewarded.

Dr. Wynne correctly asserts that educators must assume an increasingly important role in transmitting values which will contribute to the betterment of society. Derek Bok, President of Harvard University, also observed:

> There is now a movement to introduce values into the curriculum through courses in applied ethics that ask students to come to grips with significant ethical problems.

Dr. Bok concludes that "these ethical courses are essential because the institutions within society, such as families and churches, are not as influential as they once were in transmitting values."

Edmund Burke once said, "We teach but by example. Example is the school of mankind, and they will learn at no other." Society in its community of purpose now seems to demand that its educational institutions actively engage in advancing ideals which, while recognizing the importance of debate and diversity, enable us to maintain a democratic social order.

Premise 3

VALUES INSTRUCTION NEEDS TO BE DEFINED.

Definitions of values, beliefs, attitudes, morals, and ethics:

VALUES

Values may be defined as essential principles or standards which guide behavior and are unifying to the members of our democratic community, a community which depends for its existence upon the informed consent of the governed.

BELIEFS

Beliefs are states or habits of mind in which trust or confidence is placed in some person, thing or tenet. Beliefs tend to be more object- or topic-specific than are values. However, beliefs and values may be related. For example, because of a strong value individuals might place on the concept of "liberty," their beliefs about issues such as the role of government, gun control and, indeed, whom to vote for might be affected. Beliefs also may be somewhat more changeable and less deeply internalized than are values.

ATTITUDES

Attitude implies a mental predisposition, feeling or emotion toward a fact or state. Attitudes tend to be more generalized, diffuse and harder to "prove" than either values or beliefs but are related to both. For example, one's cynical attitudes about human nature may give birth to any number of beliefs and values.

MORALS

The term *moral* relates to principles of right and wrong in behavior. Most decisions we make involve a moral component, considerations of "rightness" and "wrongness," but are neither the only nor necessarily the most crucial elements present. Other criteria upon which our decisions may be based include such pragmatic considerations as personal enjoyment or fulfillment, self-preservation and effectiveness.

The term *morality* may be used to refer to particular moral principles or rules of conduct or to systems of moral conduct. Morality is the subject matter with which the discipline of ethics is concerned.

When using the term *moral development*, psychologists and educators generally are speaking of a progression in reasoning whereby people become increasingly willing and able to make and justify moral decisions on the basis of universal moral and ethical principles rather than on the basis of self-interest.

ETHICS

The term *ethics* refers to sets of moral principles or values and/or the discipline concerned with the study of moral philosophy. Moral values are those specifically relating to right and wrong behavior rather than, more generally, to a range of worthwhile principles or ideas. Problems of moral choice are generated in part by the fact that there is no single pattern of approved action in human society.

An additional complicating factor in discussing ethical behavior is that moral concepts of right and wrong vary among groups. Thus, in any assessment of ethical practices, two concerns emerge. The first has to do with the definition of the norms to be used in any such evaluation. The second has to do with application of agreed-upon norms to specific situations.

Another problem is that the ethics of some people vary over time and across situations. This makes establishing societal norms and values difficult.

The most important influences on the development of an individual's code of ethics are societal and legal prohibitions, individual conscience and moral values developed in the course of a lifetime.

Premise 4

THERE SHOULD BE RECOGNITION THAT A COMMON CORE OF VALUES EXISTS WITHIN OUR SOCIETY.

The diversity of our society has contributed to the richness of our culture. The many racial, religious and ethnic groups, both native and foreign-born, have created a diversity in our society. Yet, as the late A. Bartlett Giamatti, president of Yale University, pointed out, this diversity can be constructive:

> Diversity does not mean... the absence of standards... it signals the recognition that people of different ethnic groups and races... and personal beliefs have a right to coexist as equals under the law and have an obligation to forge the freedoms they enjoy into a coherent, civilized, and vigilant whole.

Values instruction must avoid indoctrination which advocates a specific political, theological or philosophical view.

Decisions may involve choices among personal and social values. If individuals are aware of the values which are involved in choices when a decision is made, those choices will become more rational and more capable of being defended.

It is possible, within society, to identify a series of values to be incorporated into an instructional program, consistent with those common core values necessary for our society to exist and effectively serve those that function in it.

A suggested common core of values is defined as:

Responsible citizenship
Respect for others
Respect for self
Respect for environment
Respect for knowledge

Please refer to Appendix A, page 21, for an elaboration of these values, accompanied by examples.

Premise 5

TEACHERS AND ADMINISTRATORS SHOULD HAVE A GREATER AWARENESS OF THE POTENTIAL ROLE OF VALUES IN EDUCATION AND OF THEIR PART IN TRANSMITTING VALUES.

Values are an integral part of the school program since values are contained in school programs and materials and are communicated by example. Values are being learned by experience and observation from peers, family and other societal influences.

Therefore, explicit values need to be taught methodically and deliberately within the school setting. The staff of the school needs to be aware of the importance and potential of values education in the school. Too often values instruction is carried out without this

awareness, or even the awareness that values are actually being taught. Furthermore, the values that are being taught may not be the ones which we really wish to transmit. Finally, the individual staff member, from custodian to principal, may be operating in a sort of vacuum in relation to the rest of the school in his/her efforts, conscious and unconscious, to develop or promote values among the students.

Premise 6

EDUCATORS SHOULD BE AWARE THAT VALUES ARE TAUGHT IMPLICITLY AND EXPLICITLY THROUGH THE CURRICULUM, BY INSTRUCTION, BY PRACTICES AND THROUGH PERSONAL EXAMPLE.

Values education is a logical consequence of the philosophy we profess. Believing in the worth and potential of all students, we are committed to preparing them to maintain their individuality and to find acceptable modes of social responsibility and service.

This commitment to values education permeates the entire school system. The content of the curriculum, the organization and administration of individual classrooms and the schools and the services offered to students, all play a vital role in values education. A key element is actual instruction in values education which begins with the curriculum.

Curriculum guides are reflective of the concern for values in the goals established, the concepts developed, the materials selected and the strategies recommended to promote interaction in the classroom.

Many times very specific values are portrayed and communicated by the structure, operations and methods of daily function in the school. Playground rules and behavior, structured games, methods of disciplining students, the particular behaviors of students required by teachers in the classroom, general school regulations and how the relationships between students and staff are handled are all laden with values. In some cases the values are implied; at other times they are explicitly communicated.

For example, a rigid, negative teacher may communicate the value of authoritarianism over consideration of individual feelings. Rules pertaining to quiet may communicate the values of order and consideration over spontaneity. Having everyone draw the same picture in the same way may communicate that conformity has more value than creativity or individuality.

Perhaps the method of influencing values which is the most powerful, and the most often ignored, is by example. The teacher or principal is often perceived by a child as one of the most important persons in his or her life. Thus, not only the ways we interact with the child but also our behavior in general as we are *watched by the child* become powerful influences on inculcation of values.

We have all been acquainted with situations where a given teacher has had a major impact on a child's life, for better or worse, influencing behavior, attitude and values. Those who work in the public sector with children, who by nature are trusting and impressionable, need to pay special heed to their behavior. Many times our actions speak so loudly that children do not hear our words.

Premise 7

EDUCATORS SHOULD BE AWARE OF THE DIFFERING VALUES AND ETHICS OF THE COMMUNITY.

To facilitate an awareness of differing values on the state level, representatives from the public sector and the private sector were invited to share their backgrounds, experiences and ethical perspectives through participation in committee proceedings. The following points of discussion arose:

1. Values in public schools

    a. How do you assess the effectiveness of values instruction?
    b. What do you do when values are in conflict?
    c. How do we draw attention to the values we currently teach?
    d. Who or what is the moral example?
    e. Can one source be considered the only source in teaching values?
    f. Should we teach only process values?

2. Ethics in politics and the media

    a. What is the ultimate value?
    b. Should we teach that compromise may be necessary in most issues but that a principal level must be established and maintained?
    c. Do we have an obligation to teach as a value the greatness of America?
    d. Have we truly begun to understand the impact upon our students caused by the influence of TV, and should the school system do more to modify the impact of TV?

3. Legal responsibilities surrounding values in education in public schools

    a. Does the school system have an obligation to "stimulate the moral imagination?"
    b. Should we teach tolerance of disagreement?
    c. How do we teach others to make ethical decisions?
    d. How do we teach values without engaging in inappropriate indoctrination?

4. Legal implications

    a. Which values should we teach and how?
    b. What is the role of a public school system in teaching such value-laden topics as sex education, competition, equality and morality?

5. Ethics in business

    a. What is the obligation of business to set a standard of truth and honesty in the promotion of its products?
    b. How far should business go in protecting its investment by prosecuting internal theft as well as customer theft?
    c. If business cannot succeed in changing laws that it believes unfairly inhibit it (example: ratings for movies), does business then have the right to violate those laws?

In consideration of the above discussion, the following points were noted by committee members:

1. It is very important that the community be involved in formulating any values program. The involvement of parents is vital, as is the involvement of concerned individuals and community groups. But care must be taken as to those involved in the development process, particularly with regard to individuals or groups with vested self-interest.

2. A potential problem is that values instruction may become a vehicle for injecting the personal values of the instructor rather than those values clearly agreed upon as beneficial to, and held in common by, our society.

3. Schools and school districts are cautioned that values and ideologies of questionable political and societal impact or significance are to be avoided. Values instruction should not, in any instance, become an arena for political debate or a springboard for advocating values about which there are valid questions of possible detrimental impact on our society or on the family.

4. Another caution is that values which are ***not clearly held in common*** by our society as a whole should not be included in specific values programs, but may be more wisely discussed in other settings. Such areas as specific religious tenets, abortion, human sexuality and advocating political/educational ideologies and theories are examples here.

5. Care should be taken that values instruction in whatever form not be allowed to degenerate into contentious debate. Such settings are not intended for philosophical or political argumentation.

6. It must be remembered that the family has the ultimate and greatest responsibility for teaching values to children. No school-based values program should detract from that function and responsibility.

Premise 8

KNOWLEDGE GAINED FROM RESEARCH IN THE FIELDS OF VALUES EDUCATION AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED IN DEVELOPING A PROGRAM.

There are many valuable resources to assist in the development of programs and policies, including important, valid, generally recognized research and public commentary.

Below is a sample listing of some general trends in research and literature regarding values acquisition.

Values instruction generalizations:

1. Values instruction is not morally neutral, but rather proceeds from a basic commitment to the general ideals of universal human dignity and its corollary principles: rational debate and rational consent.

2. Values are not merely matters of opinion since they may be tested in at least four distinct ways: examination of consequences or a range of alternatives, use of new cases or analogies, empathic appeal or "role exchange," and the test of subsumption (consistency among values).

3. Research indicates that values instruction, consistently undertaken, enhances students' ability to make decisions with more clarity, justify decisions more clearly and with more sophistication and understand the complexity involved in making choices.

4. Although there is cultural unity at the general value level, different individuals and groups share a set of general values with different degrees of intensity as they apply to different issues. Values instruction, then, involves *weighing* or determining a personal hierarchy of values in relation to specific issues.

5. Values instruction is a complex subject and may require additional teacher training. This issue must be decided by each school developing a values instruction program.

6. Issues and choices many times involve conflicts between and among conflicting or irreconcilable values.

7. In terms of values instruction, it is more helpful to think of values on a continuum scale. The relevant question then becomes *the extent to which* a particular value should be upheld or compromised.

Moral development generalizations:

1. Moral education involves both direct and indirect intervention of the school which affects both moral behavior and the capacity to think about issues of right and wrong. Direct intervention involves a programmatic attempt to recognize a specific set of learning goals and to achieve them within a curricular context. Indirect intervention involves the development and maintenance of a fair and responsive school environment.

2. The necessity of engaging in moral education in the schools is not a real issue because moral education is already taking place every day. Value problems arise from the formulation of the aims and content of this education.

3. The child's moral character will fully develop only in a just and concerned social atmosphere. The school should provide this environment if it wishes to influence students' moral development.

4. Whatever program of moral education the school adopts, it must respect the pluralistic traditions of America.

5. Some basic values of children do not come from the outside. Children often generate their own moral values and maintain them in the face of cultural training. These values have universal roots. For example, almost every child believes that it is bad to kill. This abhorrence of killing may be a natural empathic response, although it is not necessarily universally and consistently maintained.

6. The schools cannot be value neutral but must be engaged in moral education. Moral education must be defined in terms of universal ideals, such as justice, rather than in terms of consensus.

7. The most effective way to further students' moral development is to teach them appropriate ways of responding to moral issues and concerns. This education must emerge from some framework of assumptions. Balancing the imparting of knowledge with the encouraging of independence and individuality should be a primary goal of a formal moral education program.

8. Much of the literature in the field of moral development is based upon, or is directly critical of, the work of Harvard University Professor of Educational Psychology Lawrence Kohlberg. Kohlberg, in turn, has based much of his theory on the work of noted psychologist Jean Piaget. Piaget discovered that children ask the same philosophical questions as adults, but that their answers are different. He termed the difference a difference in stage or quality of thinking rather than a difference in amount of knowledge or accuracy of thinking.

   Kohlberg theorizes that as a child develops, he/she actively constructs a moral world view and, at each stage in his/her development, uses the same conceptual structure of reasoning to analyze different moral situations. Kohlberg posits three basic stages of moral development: (a) the preconventional stage at which moral decisions are justified in terms of personal consequences; (b) the conventional stage at which moral decisions are justified in terms of interpersonal or societal relationships; and (c) the postconventional and principled level at which moral decisions are generated from rights, values or principles that are (or could be) agreeable to all individuals composing or creating a society designed to have fair and beneficial practices. According to Kohlberg, people progress in sequence from one to the next stage of moral development, though many never reach the highest or principled level. However, there is increasing evidence that significant populations both skip and return to previous stages of development.

Generalizations concerning involvement in the school setting:

1. It is necessary for administrators and teachers to work in schools to reverse the decline in ethics, morals and values.

2. Teachers must believe that all children are equally valuable as persons, even though their abilities and circumstances are different, in order to convey moral values to children.

3. Schools incorporate values in an indirect manner. They do this by treating students in certain ways. Schools may encourage norms and the development of a sense of personal responsibility by successfully involving students in meaningful activities with clear and consistent reinforcement for positive behavior. These activities may include dance, drama, music, athletics or student government. Similarly, schools encourage students to believe in a moral order when they deal with students in a rational and caring manner using clear procedures which are both defensible and defended.

4. There is not necessarily a generally perceived need for separate courses to teach moral education or values; opportunities are implicit within existing curricula taught competently and with imagination.

5. Self-discipline as a value can be most effectively developed not by authoritarian models but by the provision for structured experience. Students need a school structure where what is required of students is clearly explained and closely linked to sets of stated goals, rather than simply announced arbitrarily. Assignments should be realistic and appropriately evaluated and rewarded. Discipline should be developed, rather than imposed, by creating structural conditions that nurture the development of self-discipline.

6. In order to transfer or inculcate any values, administrators and teachers need to analyze the school as a structure which provides a desired set of experiences for students.

Premise 9

GOALS FOR THE OUTCOME OF VALUES INSTRUCTION IN TERMS OF STUDENT BEHAVIOR AND CHARACTER DEVELOPMENT SHOULD BE ESTABLISHED.

Following exposure to values instruction, students should be more willing and better able to exhibit the behaviors outlined under the outcome goals listed below.

1. Goals for self-discipline

   a. Assumes responsibility for work and attendance
   b. Assumes responsibility for behavior, understands how choices relate to consequences
   c. Accepts the consequences of belief and actions
   d. Respects the rights of others, including those of property and freedom of speech
   e. Assumes short-term sacrifices in the pursuit of more desirable ends
   f. Pursues goals with diligence and persistence

2. Goals for rational thinking process

   a. Weighs and evaluates evidence
   b. Maintains a healthy tolerance for uncertainty and ambiguity
   c. Avoids simplistic answers to complex questions

3. Goals for living in society

   a. Respects and makes a commitment to the democratic process
   b. Respects the principles of due process
   c. Gains respect for oneself and for the diversity of individuals in American society
   d. Supports the principle of equality of rights for all, balanced by consideration of impositions on the rights of others
   e. Supports and defends the dignity of all individuals

4. Goals for action in an ethical manner

   a. Recognizes ethical issues
   b. Develops and uses analytical skills in the examination of values, ethical issues and moral choices
   c. Sorts out elements of ethical disagreement
   d. Gains insight into the ways in which individuals live their lives
   e. Learns to handle moral issues in order to develop a personal code of ethics

Premise 10

IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT A RECOGNIZED PHILOSOPHY OF VALUES INSTRUCTION AND COMMITMENT TO ITS IMPLEMENTATION BE ADOPTED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY RESOURCES, IMPLEMENTED BY THE SCHOOL SYSTEM AND COMMUNICATED TO ALL RELATED GROUPS.

From the point of view of the Task Force, the need for values instruction in our society is apparent. And, recognizing the fundamental premises of this document, it is recommended that the Arizona State Board of Education adopt a written philosophy and statement of commitment which incorporates the concepts listed below. It also is recommended that this document be utilized by individual school districts for implementation of values instruction programs.

1. Assist students in the development of insights, perspectives and skills which will set the stage for a life of personal moral responsibility.

2. Encourage students to become aware of individual and societal values, progressing toward a greater understanding of the reasons for individual values and the values of the society in which we live.

3. Aid students in understanding the relationships which exist between values and perceptions, values and choices made and choices and their consequences.

4. Provide students with learning opportunities which will introduce them to a broad range of ethical issues facing their society and the world; provide knowledge of moral traditions and give examples arising from problems of ethics.

5. Promote the analytical skills and knowledge base necessary to help students reach their own moral judgments through careful and serious reflections.

6. Establish generally acceptable life values and standards of ethical behavior as outlined in the common core of values in the educational environment and present them in classrooms in a realistic manner to serve as a favorable influence and to promote the effective health, growth and maturity of students.

7. Encourage and assist personnel and students to examine and evaluate their own personal values and behavioral systems in establishing positive, constructive attitudes and actions based on acceptable standards of fundamental respect, responsibility, character and citizenship.

8. Implement values and standards in school and daily living that promote attainment of a high degree of excellence as a human being in society and that enhance the quality of life for all individuals.

A Suggested Common Core of Values

Values may be defined as essential principles or standards which guide behavior and are unifying to the members of our democratic community, which depends for its existence upon the informed consent of the governed. A suggested common core of values based upon responsible citizenship, respect for the environment, respect for others, respect for self and respect for knowledge is outlined below, with examples to illustrate how these concepts can be integrated in a school setting.

RESPONSIBLE CITIZENSHIP

- Respect for the United States and Arizona constitutions

- Acknowledgment of and respect for authority
  To accept the need for, and primacy of, authority in given circumstances—an acknowledgment that privileges and rights in a democracy should be balanced by a sense of obligation to others

  Examples
  - following school rules
  - refraining from disrespect to authority figures, e.g., parents, teachers
  - allowing students to help establish rules

- Awareness of international relationships
  To be conscious of the interdependence of all peoples, governments and natural systems which encourage cooperation among all nations

  Examples
  - learning another language
  - awareness of other countries' economic and social systems
  - study of foreign currency exchange rates
  - student exchange programs
  - study of international trade

- Justice/Fairness
  To understand the entitlement of every person to that treatment which is his or her impartial and unprejudiced due

  Examples
  - responsibility of involvement
  - defending the rights of self and others
  - field trip to court in session
  - mock trial in class

- Patriotism
  To support or love one's country, especially through an understanding of its advantages; not inconsistent with vigorous opposition to specific governmental policies or actions; implies respect for an adherence to democracy, equality and equal opportunity for all

Examples
- understanding the meaning of the words in the Pledge of Allegiance to the flag
- caring for, appropriately using and properly disposing of the American flag
- understanding and appreciation of the United States Constitution
- learning patriotic songs
- honoring the flag during the National Anthem, presentation of colors
- study our nation's immigrants and their contributions to the United States

- Property rights
  To acknowledge the right of others to possess their property without interference

  Examples
  - turning in lost items
  - respecting the personal property of others

- Due process of law
  To understand that the American government is a rule of law—not of people—and that the U.S. Constitution and Bill of Rights is the highest law of the land

  Examples
  - refraining from making snap judgments before obtaining all the facts
  - refraining from being both prosecutor and judge
  - allowing a full hearing of each side of the story
  - emphasizing the importance of obeying all laws

- Freedom of thought and action
  To acknowledge that each individual has the right to his/her own beliefs, and the right to act on those beliefs, if they are not contrary to law or harmful to another individual or group

  Examples
  - speaking what you believe
  - keeping your innermost thoughts to yourself if you want to
  - challenging appropriately the beliefs of others, whether subordinates or superiors

- Reasoned argument
  To apply reason to justify a position; the ability to show sound judgment and common sense in decision-making

  Examples
  - making decisions about personal options and public issues in terms of reasoned values and reliable information
  - holding debates over current issues

- Respect for the law
  To acknowledge that Americans must understand, and be willing to obey, laws which allow all citizens to live together in safety

  Examples
  - following school rules
  - assisting others in learning respect for the law

RESPECT FOR OUR NATURAL ENVIRONMENT

- Care for and conservation of all living things
  To care for and conserve *all* living things on our planet

  Examples
  - developing a community garden
  - study gray whale migrations or learning about other endangered species' and their activities
  - inviting an environmental expert to class

- Care for and conservation of land, air and water
  To care for and conserve those prerequisites to life such as fertile, wooded and flowering land; clear air; and pure water

  Examples
  - study destruction of tropical rain forests and its effects
  - not littering
  - study water conservation programs
  - examining alternative modes of transportation
  - conduct on-campus recycling programs

- Recognizing environmental interdependence
  To exhibit conduct based upon knowledge that the natural environment is not locally or nationally severable, but is everywhere a part of a larger and interdependent whole

  Example
  - study balance of nature

RESPECT FOR OTHERS

- Compassion and service to others
  To display that characteristic of meaningfully sharing and responding to the feelings and needs of others which leads to providing personal assistance and comfort to them

  Examples
  - refraining from ridiculing fellow students
  - supporting fellow students in personal tragedy—loss of friends and loved ones or loss of prized possessions
  - helping children who are new to the school, town or country
  - establishing student volunteer programs
  - showing kindness by being helpful to others

- Courtesy and cooperativeness
  To recognize our mutual interdependence upon our fellow human beings which causes us to treat them politely, to respect their utterances and wishes and to work jointly with them for our common good; innovation, spontaneous creativity, critical judgment and dissent are all complementary and essential outgrowths of this attribute

Examples
- studying and practicing manners
- practicing communication skills
- using cooperative learning techniques

- Honesty
  To be free from fraud or deception, truthful, possessing integrity; to exhibit trustworthiness and fairness in speaking and acting; the absence of fraud, deceit and lying

  Examples
  - turning in found valuables or money
  - not cheating on tests
  - not forging a parent's signature

- Loyalty
  To be faithful to another individual, group or cause

  Examples
  - keeping one's part of the bargain, completing one's part of a project
  - staying with the team even when it is losing
  - standing by a friend in bad times as well as good
  - bringing the food you promised to bring to the party

- Moderation
  To demonstrate conduct which is maintained within reasonable limits so as to avoid excessive or violent extremes

  Examples
  - discussing acceptable forms of self-expression
  - using appropriate conflict resolution methods

- Recognition and understanding of various ethnic and racial traditions
  To recognize a social and historical perspective based upon an appreciation of the contributions of various ethnic and racial traditions

  Examples
  - exposing students to different music, literature and art styles
  - recognizing special days for ethnic traditions, global holidays, civil rights
  - conducting an ethnic fair
  - encouraging cultural and student exchange programs, guest speakers

- Human worth and dignity
  To accept others as being worthwhile individuals; to recognize the uniqueness of each person and to treat all people with respect

  Examples
  - treating each person as you expect to be treated
  - knowing that people are different and respecting their uniqueness
  - refraining from functioning as if one group is better or worse than another

- Tolerance
  To acknowledge the right of an individual's or group's belief or practice that differs from or conflicts with one's own, unless such actions are contrary to law or policy

Examples
- respecting fellow students' rights to determine the way they dress or wear their hair
- being a willing listener and observer
- refraining from actions which would hurt others
- eliminating prejudicial actions because of race, sex, handicap, age , religion or ethnic origin

- Equality of opportunity under the law
  To believe that under the law everyone is allowed the same opportunity for success, regardless of sex, age, race, handicap, religion or ethnicity

Examples
- sharing of classroom opportunities
- providing open elections for class officers
- establishing scholarship programs not based solely on grades

RESPECT FOR SELF

- Accountability
  To recognize the obligation each of us carries to explain and justify our conduct; the resultant circumstance of being answerable for our actions

Examples
- turning homework in as assigned
- being responsible for our own actions
- accepting the consequences of our actions

- Courage
  To be willing to face obstacles, including danger, with determination; the ability to make individual choices independent of peer pressure

Examples
- reading literature about heroes and courageous people
- reviewing other disciplines such as art, music, mathematics or physics, for instances of courageous acts or thinking
- identifying risk-takers in history—those people whose risks made a positive contribution to our society

- Frugality/Thrift
  To wisely manage assets, including natural resources; the avoidance of unnecessary expenditures and conservation of time, energy and money

Examples
- using classroom activities to develop a savings plan for each student
- establishing an in-room store
- planning parties or trips and expenses involved
- developing a budget for school-related activities

- Self-esteem and pride
  To believe in oneself and one's own potential for successful participation in our society; must be moderated by tolerance for others

  Examples
  - developing programs to encourage self-esteem
  - developing honors system for classroom
  - encouraging positive sharing programs in classroom
  - establishing citizen-of-the-month programs, stars, awards
  - encouraging cleanliness and personal hygiene

- Self-discipline
  To display a persistent desire and ability to apply oneself with care and effort to occupations and relationship to attain desired goals

  Examples
  - establishing a citizenship grade on report cards
  - planning group and individual projects and activities
  - developing one's own work plan or contract
  - providing self-directed learning opportunities without direct supervision

- Self-reliance
  To be willing to be responsible for one's own needs and well-being

  Examples
  - determining specific ways students can become independent in their studies (through homework completion, attentiveness to classwork) and responsible for all learning activities
  - developing programs providing opportunities for students to experience independent projects

- Cleanliness
  To have commitment to personal hygiene and willingness to make school and home environments as clean as possible

  Examples
  - developing personal hygiene habits at home and school
  - joining with other students to improve the school environment, eliminating grafitti

RESPECT FOR KNOWLEDGE

- Desire to learn
  To be devoted to developing one's mind and gaining knowledge and understanding

  Examples
  - making learning exciting
  - providing activities to stimulate children's enthusiasm
  - encouraging field trips

- Analytic, creative and evaluative thinking
  To exhibit a desire for learning based on a commitment to logical and rational inquiry as well as curiosity

Example
- basing judgment on an analysis of a problem or situation and seeing more than one perspective
- demonstrating a variety of solutions to the same problem, no single "right way"

- Application of knowledge
  To display knowledge gained through experience or association; respecting an individual who is knowledgeable; the ability to *apply* knowledge in a meaningful way; recognition that the body of knowledge is constantly expanding

  Examples
  - designing projects for improving learning in the classroom
  - encouraging answers - without fear of ridicule for wrong answers

- Objectivity
  To express or use facts without distortion from personal feelings or prejudices

  Examples
  - Designing projects according to established rules of research
  - writing research papers using both sides of an issue or event
  - study of statistics
  - study materials whose objectivity is in question, such as political brochures, newspaper advertising and editorials, TV commercials

- Order
  To use the customary mode of procedure and sequences, symmetry

  Examples
  - study outlining procedures
  - design flow charts for various topics
  - study ecological chains such as the food chain
  - reviewing student policies and procedures
  - showing examples of dependent sequences - examining a dependent sequence of various topics
  - encouraging clean and tidy desks

It is the hope of this Task Force that all people become aware of the consequences of their actions in the areas discussed above, whether or not they are directly involved in educating our children in a school setting.

APPENDIX B
STATE BOARD MEMBERS COMMENTS ON VALUES EDUCATION REPORT

Introduction

Comments were prepared and forwarded to Dr. Paul Koehler, Chair of the Values Education Task Force, by two members of the State Board of Education. Claudeen Bates-Arthur commented in September 1990 and Ada Thomas sent comments twice in May 1990 and again in August 1990. The full unedited text of these remarks is provided below. References are to the final report contained in Appendix A, unless specific page references are given.

Comments of Claudeen Bates-Arthur, September 10, 1990

Page 1 - RECOMMENDATION TO STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION. This recommendation indicates that the local school boards would be encouraged to teach and reinforce a common core of values. However, the common core of values is said to be selected and recommended to the local school district governing boards by the parents, community members, and educators. If this process works as stated then each community would and could adopt a different set of values thus negating any suggestion that our Arizona students are learning a common core of values. Since the values in the report are a "suggested" method of approaching the subject and presumably "a suggested common core of values" the values to be taught, how and when they are taught, will be decided by each local school community. There is inherent in this approach a grave danger that a minority in the community will find imposed on them the views and wishes of a majority. This country was founded on the rights of individuals to their personal beliefs and values regardless of the majority opinion and this right of individuals may well be in jeopardy with this type of program.

Having made these initial comments, the next portion of this letter addresses specifics:

Page 3 - the PREMISES are listed:

1. CHILDREN DO NOT AUTOMATICALLY HOLD VALUES - THEY LEARN THEM; THEREFORE, VALUES MUST BE TAUGHT.

   While all may agree with such statement, the real question is, taught by whom and what values?

2. EDUCATORS MUST UNDERSTAND THAT SOCIETY SUPPORTS AN INCREASED ROLE FOR THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS IN VALUES INSTRUCTION.

   I'm concerned about the fifteen to twenty percent that don't favor such instruction in the schools. In other words, the danger that the minority may have forced on them a majority opinion.

3. VALUES INSTRUCTION NEEDS TO BE DEFINED.

4. THERE SHOULD BE RECOGNITION THAT A COMMON CORE OF VALUES EXISTS WITHIN OUR SOCIETY.

   With regard to number three and number four - I agree that any values instruction if it is to be suggested to school districts in Arizona needs to be very carefully and narrowly defined. I believe that the values listed are indeed common but I do not

see through the rest of the paper a narrowing of discussion strictly to these five core values.

5. TEACHERS AND ADMINISTRATORS SHOULD HAVE A GREATER AWARENESS OF THEIR ROLE OF VALUES IN EDUCATION AND OF THEIR PART IN TRANSMITTING VALUES.

6. EDUCATORS SHOULD BE AWARE THAT VALUES ARE TAUGHT IMPLICITLY AND EXPLICITLY THROUGH THE CURRICULUM, BY INSTRUCTION, BY PRACTICES AND THROUGH PERSONAL FXAMPLE.

I agree with number five and number six.

7. EDUCATORS SHOULD BE AWARE OF THE DIFFERING VALUES AND ETHICS OF THE COMMUNITY.

I would suggest that not only is it important that the community be involved, it would be essential. It would also be essential that the community formulating values not only be aware but also adopt values and ethics that reflect all minority as well as majority community members.

8. KNOWLEDGE GAINED FROM RESEARCH IN THE FIELD OF VALUES EDUCATION AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED IN DEVELOPING A PROGRAM.

9. GOALS FOR THE OUTCOME OF VALUES INSTRUCTION IN TERMS OF STUDENT BEHAVIOR AND CHARACTER DEVELOPMENT SHOULD BE ESTABLISHED.

I agree with number eight and nine.

10. IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT A RECOGNIZED PHILOSOPHY OF VALUES INSTRUCTION AND COMMITMENT TO ITS IMPLEMENTATION BE ADOPTED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY RESOURCES, IMPLEMENTED BY THE SCHOOL SYSTEM AND COMMUNICATED TO ALL RELATED GROUPS.

Number ten again brings up the question of adoption or recommendation or simply receipt of a report.

The State Board of Education probably would agree to adopt a commitment to a values education program which promotes a higher degree of excellence for all human beings. The problem is, defining what is meant by a values education program and how that program is presented to the local school districts.

Page 5 - A SUGGESTED COMMON CORE OF VALUES. The listing of various elements under the suggested core of values needs clarification.

Responsible Citizenship - a) A large portion of Arizona's children have some allegiance to a third governmental entity; that is their tribal government. These governments have constitutions or other governing documents. It would be ill advised to ignore this fact. Perhaps the wording "respect for constitutional/governing documents" might be a way to put this. b) Acknowledgment of authority and respect for the law should include understanding the legitimate process for change and for challenge of abuse of authority and unjust laws. c) The concept of justice, fairness is simply too board. What is just and what is fair may very well depend on an individual view point. The same is true of patriotism. d) The statement "property rights" needs to be narrowed to include the word "respect for."

Respect for Environment - Under this section, care for, and conservation of all living beings, may need to be changed to use the words living things. I'm not sure that all persons would agree that living trees are beings, but they are living things. Conservation of trees is an important concept.

Respect for Others - One can respect others without necessarily cooperating in a particular endeavor. I don't know what moderation means in relation to respect for others. It seems one either respect others or one doesn't.

Various ethnic traditions should not only to be recognized and understood but accepted. I would add the word acceptance.

Respect for Self - Frugality and thrift are listed. These concepts relate to use of material things. My question is whether or not that relates to respect for self. It might relate more to conservation of things or to respect for property rights.

Respect for Knowledge - This should be based on a general appreciation for knowledge in the pure scientific sense of the word; knowledge which is important for its own sake.

Page 6 - PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION RECOMMENDATIONS. There is an inconsistency here. The statement says "suggestions for implementation," while 1) the term recommendation is used.

Page 6 (bottom) - 5) There is a statement that provision needs to be made for evaluation. How do you evaluate whether or not children are learning these values? Under 4), the values instruction program recommendations cannot and may not be in conflict with state law. It also should be specifically stated that such a program must not be in conflict with constitutional guarantees of individual rights nor should it be in conflict with the ethnic or cultural values of the students.

Page 10 - PREMISE 1: The statements made here are very, very general. I am not sure on what basis we would be able to say unequivocally that beneficial values are not being acquired or that there are more ambiguities and problems in our values then ever before in the history of our nation. I believe that various changes occur as societies develop but I'm not sure that's an indication that there are more problems. A statement that "the negative influences of media, divorce, and negative peer pressure," is the reason for anything without data to back it up is suspect. The statement from influence of others doesn't mean anything.

Page 10 - PREMISE 2: "These responses to the public opinion poll reflect a poor moral climate" is a conclusory statement.

Page 11 - There is a statement that "society in its community of purposes seems to demand that our educational institutions engage in advancing ideals which enable us to maintain a democratic social order." It does not seem appropriate to adopt the whole program based on what is perceived as society's seeming demands. Further more, I think it may be equally true that a democratic society believes that open and vigorous debate and diversity result in the maintenance of democratic social order.

Page 12 - PREMISE 3: There is a statement on the bottom of the page acknowledging that "there is no single pattern of approved action in human society." If that is indeed true, it goes against the report premise that there is indeed a basic core of values that can be adopted. This seems inconsistent.

Page 13 - PREMISE 5: [Editor's Note: The sentence referred to does not appear in the final report.] The fourth paragraph states as a suggested way to teach values to

challenge students to discover values "which will bring them success and happiness." Question, what is meant by success and what is meant by happiness? It is not clear to me that persons who are viewed in one cultural society as successful and/or happy would be the same in another society or culture. Just as an example, it may very well be that a drug dealer in the streets of New York who has a lot of money is looked upon by young people in that culture as successful.

I realize that the values education task force put a lot of time and effort into this document and I appreciate and respect the work that they did on this extremely difficult subject. Nevertheless, I believe that merely suggesting to local schools that they might wish to adopt a program and suggesting to them vague and ambiguous terms which allow a wide range of interpretation is not desirable. If such a program were to be adopted and approved at the State Board level some of the ambiguity must be eliminated. I also believe there needs to be more thought given to diversity in our culture, acceptance of that diversity, acceptance of dissent, discussion, and the right of individuals to believe differently and to actually be different in this society. This is after all a basic constitutional premise.

It is my recommendation that the State Board simply accept the report. Without further specificity I would not recommend that the State Board endorse such a program for adoption at the local level.

Comments of Ada Thomas, May 21, May 31 and August 20, 1990

21 May 1990

Ambiguities in the Ten Premises established by the Values Education Task Force Committee:

Premise 1. This premise does not define the boundaries of what values, or whose values, are to be taught. Promoting the well-being of society and individuals, intrudes into the realm of the individual's concept of well-being, and their right to choose the life style, and philosophy, that enhances their idea of what constitutes well-being, and which, in a free society, is their right, as long as it is within the boundaries of law and order established by society.

Premise 2. The fact that a poll indicates a majority of people think there should be an increase in the role of public schools in values education, does not mean that it should be. Generally, the more restrictive a society becomes, the more demand on the public schools to indocrinate the values of that society.

Premise 3. What needs to be defined, here, is a clear definition of what standards and whose standards - the religious community, the State, or an arbitrary task force?

Premise 4. This common core concept, is not necessarily true; it is, more, a composite of many cores of belief, that function independently within our constitutional framework and regional social acceptance.

Premise 5. This greater role of teachers and administrators is really of their own choosing, and its ultimate effect is a downplay on the part of the family, and its, first responsibility for values teaching in society.

Premise 6. In principle, values should not be taught through a curriculum, or by teachers, without a clear definition of boundaries, and what, and whose values are being taught.

Premise 7. This is a completely theortical, impractical and easily abused concept. It admits values and ethics differ in each community; therefore, no common core, as such, exists that will reflect all the community groups, as is assumed by the Task Force Committee.

Premise 8. There are a multitude of resource groups, reflecting educators and writers of every persuasion. Further, who is going to choose the resource group or groups for developing a program?

Premise 9. Who determines if a student's behavior fits this common core of values, and what is to be done about it? What happens to the students who don't fit this common core?

Premise 10. Again, whose philosophy of values? What community resources? How implemented (by regimentation? - as in all restrictive societies? What related groups, and why? Normally, this is to obtain better control and regimentation of thought, and behavior of all students.

Mu purpose in the above comments, is to illustrate my concern in the many words used that are not defined, and have no established boundaries for their application. It makes me call to mind what Humpty Dumpty said to Alice in Wonderland. "When I use a word" said Humpty Dumpty, "it means just what I want it to mean, no more nor less. Its a question of who is the master".

With respect to the 10 Premises, the master will be the ones who use them, and can thus define them for their own purposes. On the other hand, the values we have come up with have been defined, and in my opinion, can well be used without the need for the 10 Premises. I feel these Premises should be deleted from our final report.

It will be noted on pages 10 to 27, are subsequent interpretations, justifications, arbritary definitions and explanations relating to these 10 premises. This addendum is thus also ill-defined, and could easily be intrepretated to obtain a wide spectrum of values. For this reason, this addendum should also not be a part of this report. I recommend that it be deleted.

31 May 1990

Teaching Values Education by "Challenge and Discovery"

Students in a values education class will have come with their own sets of values. These values will be personal; they govern their thinking and way of life.

We should recognize, that youth do not obtain their values by intellectual persuasion, but from association with other people. From this influence of others, youth adopt values that offer the most for success and happiness.

Because the lives of other people influence our choice of values, I feel, a values education class should be conducted on the principle of "Challenge and Discovery". By this, I mean, challenging the students to discover values they feel will bring the greatest success and happiness; then suggesting they search the lives of chosen ideals to discover the values that made those individuals successful.

The role of a teacher in a values education class conducted in this manner, will be to initiate the challenge, and then assist the students in finding the desired information about the people whose lives they have chosen to study.

Students engaged in searching the life of a chosen ideal, will experience that life by proxy. The values, and incidently, the moral code of that chosen ideal, will tend to become their own.

From the above, it can be understood why I object to our initial ten premises, and why I have suggested ten new premises that could serve as a foundation for this new approach to values education.

As a values education committee, we have developed sets of values we feel are basic, and would serve our youth well. I feel, these sets of values, together with the new ten premises, can effectively be used by the values education teacher, to assist the students in recognizing these values in the lives of their chosen ideals.

PREMISES

1. VALUES ARE IDEAS WE HAVE ACQUIRED THAT REFLECT OUR CONCEPT OF WHAT MAKES A SUCCESSFUL LIFE.

2. BASIC VALUES ARE THOSE WOVEN INTO THE FABRIC OF OUR SOCIETY.

3. IT IS THE RESPONSIBILITY OF OUR PUBLIC SCHOOLS TO TEACH ONLY BASIC VALUES.

4. UNDERSTANDING THE BASIC VALUES IS WHAT ENLARGES OUR CONCEPT OF HOW TO OBTAIN A SUCCESSFUL LIFE.

5. VALUES MAY BE TAUGHT, BUT THEY ARE ACCEPTED ONLY WHEN WE RELATE THEM TO A SUCCESSFUL LIFE.

6. OBSERVING AND EVALUATING WHAT WE CONSIDER A SUCCESSFUL LIFE OF OTHERS, GIVES US A FEELING, OR EXPERIENCE OF THEIR LIVES, BY PROXY.

7. THE WILLINGNESS TO TRY NEW VALUES, MUST BE PRECEDED BY HAVING ACCEPTED THE CHALLENGE TO DO SO.

8. THE ULTIMATE CHALLENGE WE CAN GIVE OUR YOUTH FOR LEARNING AND ADOPTING VALUES, IS FOR THEM TO DISCOVER THOSE VALUES IN THE LIFE OF A CHOSEN IDEAL OR IDEALS.

9. THE ULTIMATE CHALLENGE IN TEACHING IS BEING ABLE TO INSTILL BASIC VALUES AND IDEALS IN OUR YOUTH.

10. THREE BASIC VALUES IN GENERAL:

    1. A MORAL CODE (OUR OWN). ALL CULTURES HAVE THEM.

    2. OBEDIENCE TO LAW.

    3. DEVOTION TO PERSONAL PROGRESS, AND TO THE WELFARE AND PRESERVATION OF OUR SOCIETY.

20 August 1990

1. The Values Education Program, as it now stands, is proposed to be optional, such that the local schools can by-pass our program and write their own, choosing whatever values they may desire. This, in my opinion, negates all the work we have done, and opens the door for any values clarification curriculum the schools may care to subscribe.

2. Many areas of this Program are, again in my opinion, quite ambiguous, which allows for arbitrary interpretations, that could be at variance with the intent and purpose of the values that were so carefully considered by the values committee. These ambiguities were set forth in my two memorandums dated 21 May and 31 May 1990.

APPENDIX C

VALUES EDUCATION TASK FORCE MEMBERS

Rosalina Baldonado
Assistant Principal
Marcos de Niza High School
2144 South Los Feliz Drive
Tempe, AZ 85282

Robin Berry
Principal
Maricopa School
P. O. Box 630
Maricopa, AZ 85239

Dennis E. Broadbent, Ph.D.
Southwest Institute for Behavioral Studies
14231 N. 7th Street, Suite 4A
Phoenix, AZ 85022

L. Craig Campbell
Consultant
National Corrective Training Institute
3104 East Camelback Road, #274
Phoenix, AZ 85016-4502

Robert Constas, M.D.
12212 North 58th Place
Scottsdale, AZ 85254

Phillip E. England
Superintendent
Camp Verde Unified School District
P.O. Box 728
Camp Verde, AZ 86322

Rosemary Enloe
Board of Directors
Suicide Prevention Center
5314 East Yale
Phoenix, AZ 85008

J. Robert Hendricks, Ed.D.
Superintendent
Flowing Wells Unified School District
1556 West Prince Road
Tucson, AZ 85705

Paul H. Koehler, Ph.D.
Chair of Task Force, 542-5254
Associate Superintendent for Education Services
Arizona Department of Education
1535 West Jefferson
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Michael G. Nickerson, Ph.D.
Congregational Development and Conference Program
The United Methodist Church
2633 E. Indian School Rd., # 402
Phoenix, AZ 85016-6763

Joyce Lopez Powell
Fund Distribution Associate
Valley of the Sun United Way
1515 East Osborn Road
Phoenix, AZ 85014

W. P. Shofstall, Ph.D.
Former Superintendent of Public Instruction
138 Encanto Drive
Tempe, AZ 85281

Honorable Lela Steffey
Arizona State Representative
Capitol Building, House Wing
1700 West Washington
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Honorable Margaret Updike
Arizona State Representative
Capitol Building, House Wing
1700 West Washington
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Janet A. Velasco, Ed.D.
Assistant Principal
Corona del Sol High School
2523 West Onza
Mesa, AZ 85202

Dave Wood
Governing Board Member
Phoenix Union High School District
6039 West Vernon Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85035

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Baltimore County Public Schools (1986) *A Report of the Task Force on Values Education and Ethical Behavior*, Towson, MD: Baltimore County Public Schools.

Blendinger, J. and Jones, L. (1989) "Start With Culture To Improve Your Schools," *The School Administrator*, 46, (5) pp. 22-25 (May).

Childer, K. (1989) "Reflections on Moral Education," *Research in Brief*, pp. 1-2 (October).

Coles, R. and Genevie L. (1990) "The Moral Life of America's Schoolchildren" *Teacher*, pp. 42-49 (March).

Kessler, H. (1989) "Indiana Embraces Values Education," *Education USA*, 32, (17) pp. 127-128 (December).

Landried, S. (1988) "Talking To Kids About Things That Matter," *Educational Leadership*, 45, (8) pp. 32-35 (May).

Lickona, T. (1988) "How Parents and Schools Can Work Together to Raise Moral Children," *Educational Leadership*, 45, (8) pp. 36-38 (May).

New Jersey State Department of Education (1989) *Implementation Plan for Developing Character and Values in New Jersey Students*, Trenton, NJ: New Jersey State Department of Education.

New Jersey State Department of Education (1989) *Report of the Advisory Council on Developing Character and Values in New Jersey Students*, Trenton, NJ: New Jersey State Department of Education.

Peoria Unified School District (1986) *Student Responsibility Program. Kindergarten-Sixth Grade"* 6v., Peoria, AZ: Peoria Unified School District.

Ryan, K. and Greer, P. (1990) "Putting Moral Education Back in Schools," *The Education Digest*, 55, (5) pp. 31-34 (January).

Schmidt, P. (1990) "Despite Controversy, Consensus Grows On the Need To Teach Values in Schools," *Education Week*, 6, (20) pp. 9-10 (February).

Printed in Phoenix, Arizona by the Arizona Department of Education
Total Copies Printed.....30
Total Printing Cost.....$65.00
Unit Printing Cost.....$2.16
Date of Printing.....10/90

Reprint: 300 Copies, $541.00, $1.81, 11/90
Reprint: 100 Copies, $250.00, $2.50, 1/91